

Volume 24, Number 1, September 2021

## Revision

# The Anglo-Irish Treaty

*Nicholas Fellows*

Consider the following source question on the Anglo-Irish Treaty, then use the tables below to structure and write your response.

## Question

Using these four sources in their historical context, assess the view that the Anglo-Irish Treaty of 1921 was a political failure.

### Source A Clause 1 of the Anglo-Irish Treaty

Ireland shall have the same constitutional status in the Community of Nations known as the British Empire as the Dominion of Canada, the Commonwealth of Australia, the Dominion of New Zealand, and the Union of South Africa, with a Parliament having powers to make laws for the peace, order and good government of Ireland and an Executive responsible to that Parliament, and shall be styled and known as the Irish Free State.

*Treaty between Great Britain and Ireland, December 1921*

### Source B A survivor of 1916 Easter Rising and leader of Sinn Fein comments on dominion status

The only banner under which our freedom can be won at the present time is the Republican banner. It is as an Irish republic that we have a chance of getting international recognition. Some might have faults to find with that and prefer other forms of government. But we are all united on this -that we want complete and absolute independence. This is the time to get freedom. Then we can settle by the most democratic means what particular form of government we may have.

*Speech by Eamon De Valera, 1922*

### Source C A Nationalist politician gives his view on partition

I am opposed to the Treaty because it gives away our allegiance and perpetuates partition. By that very fact that it perpetuates our slavery; by the fact that it perpetuates partition it must fail utterly to do what it is ostensibly intended to do — reconcile the aspirations of the Irish people to association with the British Empire. When did the achievement of our nation's unification cease to be one of our national aspirations?

The provisions of this Treaty mean that in the North of Ireland certain people differing from us somewhat in tradition, and differing in religion, are going to be driven, in order to maintain their separate identity, to demarcate themselves from us.

*Sean MacEntee, speech in the Dail Eireann, December 1921*

### Source D A Unionist politician gives his view on partition

We believe that so long as we were without a Parliament of our own, constant attacks would be made upon us, and constant attempts would be made to draw us into a Dublin Parliament, and that is the last thing in the world that we desire to happen. We see our safety, therefore, in having a parliament of our own, for we believe that once a parliament is set up and working well, as I have no doubt it would in Ulster, we should fear no-one.

*Captain C. C. Craig, speech in the House of Commons, March 1920*

## How to approach the Sources

In order to score well, you will need to consider both the provenance of the source and apply contextual knowledge to the source to test the validity of its view.

1. First of all, you need to be clear what each source is saying about the Anglo-Irish Treaty.

Source	What are the key words which show what the source is saying about the Anglo-Irish Treaty?
A	
B	
C	
D	

2. What is the view of the sources about the issue in the question?

Source	Support or challenge? View of key issue	Evidence from the source to support the view
Source A		
Source B		
Source C		
Source D		

3. Is there anything in the provenance that you need to take into account when assessing these sources?

Source	What is it?	When written?	Why was it written?	Is the author in a position to know?	Might the author be prejudiced either for or against the Treaty?
A					
B					
C					
D					

4. What knowledge do you have which might confirm or question the evidence which the source is offering?

Source	Knowledge to support the source	Knowledge to challenge the source
A		
B		
C		
D		

5. In light of explaining the view of the source, considering its provenance and using contextual knowledge, you are in a position to make a judgement about each source and the extent to which it supports the view that Treaty was a political failure.

Source	Judgement
A	
B	
C	
D	

You are now in a position to write your answer, once you have done that, you can use a checklist like the one below:

Have I considered all four sources? Y/N

Have I just described the Sources? Y/N

Have I picked out from each source the key points which relate to the question? Y/N

How much have I written about provenance? Highlight everything in yellow

How much contextual knowledge have I used? Highlight everything in red

Have I offered a clear view about whether the Treaty was a political failure? Y/N

Have I made interim judgements about each source? Y/N

Have I made an overall judgement about whether the sources show it was a political failure? Y/N

This resource is part of MODERN HISTORY REVIEW, a magazine written for A-level students by subject experts. To subscribe to the full magazine go to: <http://www.hoddereducation.co.uk/historyreview>