

Volume 2, Number 2, November 2015

Group 3: geography

The development debate

Grace Elliott

Motion: this house believes that both aid and trade are required to close the development gap.

The following debate requires the class to divide into three groups.

- Each group will adopt the perspective that they have been allocated.
- Each group must first research the perspective that they have been allocated, and then prepare a 3-minute speech to address the motion.
- The class will conduct a debate, allowing each group to perform their speech before entering debate and questions.

First group: 'Trade not aid' perspective

What is the argument?

Supporters of the 'trade, not aid' perspective argue that development should be based on an expansion of international trade and increasing exports of developing countries, while aid should be limited if not abandoned altogether.

Why?

In this argument you must explore the concepts below (in addition to other aspects of the argument):

- The failures of aid to effectively address the problem of growth and development.
- The ability of trade to make major contributions to growth and development, provided rich countries abandon their protectionist policies.

Resources

<http://www.theguardian.com/business/2009/may/25/africa-entrepreneurs-charity>

http://www.huffingtonpost.com/dambisa-moyo/aid-ironies-a-response-to_b_207772.html

<http://www.nytimes.com/2012/06/28/opinion/beijing-a-boon-for-africa.html>

<http://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2010/dec/11/china-long-record-helping-africa?INTCMP=SRCH>

Second group: 'Aid for trade' perspective

What is the argument?

More and more economists believe that to be able to benefit from international trade, developing countries must have the institutional capacity to increase their exports. This perspective asserts that both trade and aid are important for growth and development and, in addition, aid and trade should be linked together so that a portion of aid is used to support the development of institutions that improve a country's ability to export.

Why?

This argument must explore the constraints to development, and how these constraints can be overcome effectively through aid.

This approach requires that aid and trade policies be integrated, so that a policy geared towards increasing exports is based on assistance aiming to strengthen the abilities of developing countries to achieve increases in exports.

Resources

http://www.wto.org/english/tratop_e/devel_e/a4t_e/aid4trade_e.htm

<http://www.theguardian.com/global-development/poverty-matters/2011/jun/20/agriculture-market-access-to-feed-world>

<http://policy-practice.oxfam.org.uk/publications/rigged-rules-and-double-standards-trade-globalisation-and-the-fight-against-pov-112391>

<http://www.theguardian.com/world/2008/sep/24/unitednations.food>

Third group: 'Trade and aid' perspective

What is the argument?

Supporters of 'trade and aid' argue that while trade and export growth are very important for growth and development, they are not enough in the case of low-income (very poor) countries.

Why?

In this argument you must explore the concepts below (in addition to other aspects of the argument).

Many of the serious weaknesses of aid are the responsibility of donors. These include tied aid, conditionality of aid, volatility and unpredictability of aid, and lack of donor coordination of aid.

In some situations trade may be unable to help, making aid necessary:

- rich country agricultural subsidies
- developing country dependence on commodity exports
- the poverty cycle
- countries have little to export

Resources

<http://africanarguments.org/2009/03/08/advancing-african-development-the-necessity-for-aid-and-trade/>

http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2015/04/22/bernie-sanders-fast-track_n_7118242.html

This resource is part of IB REVIEW, a magazine written for A-level students by subject experts.

To subscribe to the full magazine go to www.hoddereducation.co.uk/ibreview